



National Association of
City Transportation Officials

Linda Bailey
Executive Director

120 Park Avenue, 20th Floor
New York, NY 10017
nacto@nacto.org

www.nacto.org

NACTO's 12/15/17 Webinar – Unanswered Questions

“Curb Your Enthusiasm: Managing High-Demand Curbside Passenger Loading Zones”

Thank you for tuning in to our webinar! As we were not able to answer all your questions during the event, we have compiled responses to all unanswered questions. If you have any further questions, comments, or concerns, do not hesitate to reach out to events@nacto.org.

Questions to NACTO:

Design Guidance

- For peak hour bus lanes, that are parking lanes off-peak, is there a recommendation for pavement markings? (i.e. the "dashed" red lane like shared bus/right turn, etc)
 - We recommend striping a solid white line outside of the lane, and marking the lane with “BUS ONLY”. Accompanying signage should state the hours of operation. Red should only be used in full-time bus-only areas. More information on peak-only bus lanes can be found in the Transit Street Design Guide [here](#).

Examples

- NACTO: For the Nostrand Avenue example, the question regarding what merchants would prefer, did you ask merchants if they prefer the status quo including say... private metered auto parking?
 - NYC DOT carried out this survey; the resulting report is [here](#), and doesn't mention this specific question.
- NACTO, your graphic indicated that an example loading zone was worth \$10K @ 20 deliveries. Where was this approximation derived from?
 - This was a somewhat conservative approximation based on information found online regarding (a) average size of restaurant and retail spaces (b) sales needed per square foot to have a moderate profit (c) an estimation of 50% of a block's area being dedicated to food service or retail, and (d) an estimation of 1 delivery per day per business. This doesn't include parcel deliveries for other kinds of nearby businesses (e.g. services) or residents, though, so the capacity of a single delivery/loading space could be much more than 20 deliveries per day assuming parking duration is limited. The number of deliveries supported and the value of supported sales could vary wide depending on the amount and type of business activity.

Questions to D.C.:

- For the night parking restriction, I still want to know the measures to accommodate night club customer's parking, like back of building parking? Do some residential people live in the high floor of those night club buildings? How about their parking during night? Underground parking?
 - Visitors to the area are encouraged to take alternative transportation (Metrorail/Metrobus; TNCs/Taxis). If they do indeed drive, they can park on adjacent blocks. Adjacent blocks to the pilot area are metered. Those meters are regulated from 7AM-10PM Monday-Saturday. Outside of that, those spaces are unregulated. Furthermore, there are privately owned and operated commercial garages open in the vicinity during this period for patrons to park. There may be some residents in the area, but it is very, very limited. Most residential land uses start north of DuPont Circle on Connecticut Ave. The predominant land use in the study area is commercial mixed use.

- For DC, did you perform a parking study before removing the parking spots or did you just remove them without any study?
 - We did a curbside audit to understand the supply (spatial and temporal allocation of curb uses). We also did time-lapse photography work to visualize the problem and allow us to qualitatively assess the situation. Due to budgetary constraints, we did not quantitatively assess the time-lapse photography. There is capability to have vendors do turnover counts and pedestrian counts from those videos, but we did not exercise that.

- How is the study considering curbside truck loading zones?
 - Curbside freight loading zones are predominantly active from 7AM-6:30 PM Monday-Saturday. Limited freight activity during nightlife hours, especially in this area where the businesses are open during night hours, meaning they've received their deliveries before/after their main operational hours. Loading zones, as a curbside use similar to residential/customer parking (but even more essential since there is no alternative for deliveries), need to be considered in curbside pilots. In this case, it was a non-issue due to the days/hours of need not overlapping. It is likely to be a bigger issue in future applications if there is overlap during freight hours and passenger drop off zone needs.

- Has there been an issue differentiating between an actual TNC and a private vehicle and does that distinction actually matter?
 - Distinction doesn't matter in this application. We did not want to have enforcement be worried of making determination, thus the restriction curbside just notes "No Parking". That means anyone can stand or stop curbside to do their business then move along. Traffic Control Officers and Metropolitan Police Department officers are regularly sweeping the lanes to keep them moving (akin to airport curbside operations).

- How did you initiate contact with TNCs - did you speak to national TNC operators, or local offices?
 - General conversations with TNCs was a blend of national and local office staff. Collaboration started as a result of preparations for the 2017 Inauguration in Autumn 2016. Since that time, the conversations with TNCs are with their local/regional staff. Pilot specific conversations were between the Golden Triangle BID and the TNC local staff.
- How do you handle tour buses?
 - Stay tuned in 2018, for that is a major priority for us to handle, considering we are the top destination for tour buses in the United States.
- DC: When did you know you had to create a curbside program?
 - We've always had a curbside program. Think the question is more along the lines of when did we realign our curbside management values in the new multimodal transportation paradigm. That has been in the past few years, when we have been welcoming easily over 1,000 residents a month in the District, which in turn has meant a huge spike in real estate development (and the proliferation of the District's state bird - the construction crane). Put the new residents, who may be used to an auto-centric mobility into this new development in a constrained, built out arterial transportation network, and the District is faced with a growing mobility challenge. It is in such an environment that we have shifted from accommodating the parker curbside to challenge the idea that the automobile is the only mobility option. This new mindset has our team now looking at ways to improve multimodal curbside access for bikes, commercial vehicles, motor coaches, TNCs, car sharing, and other modes of transportation vs solely just the car.
- Do you have a full curb inventory? If not, how are you going about getting an inventory? Would it be a static inventory or somehow dynamic?
 - Something we are working little by little with existing agency resources. In certain areas of the District, as part of neighborhood curbside management conversations, we did a street level imagery curbside audit. We also leveraged a vendor to not only do street level imagery of all District roadways and alleys, but to digitize signage information. That was Summer 2016 and the inventory is still being QA/QC'd. In parallel, we are improving our sign shop workflow, so when the sign inventory is complete, the inventory can be dynamic to sign shop changes curbside. We do have a full loading zone inventory however, you can see where they are as well as details including hours of operation, length, etc. at www.godcgo.com/truckandbusmap. Check with NYC, Arlington, or Seattle about full curb inventories and how they went about it.
- How'd you get the TNC data? We'd love that data.
 - DDOT does not have TNC data (we'd love it too). Golden Triangle BID engaged the TNCs and asked analysis questions for the TNCs (particularly related to hot pick up drop off blocks) to answer and report back to them. There is a NACTO led effort to standardize the data requests with TNCs for cities, in hopes to address the concerns of the TNC operators and the needs of cities.

- How did you identify the users of the curb space between the hours of 10pm and 7am? I think I heard they were mostly employees in the area. I ask because I'm wondering about residential parking in a city that is highly coveted, specifically during that 10pm and 7am time period.
 - You are correct that residential parking is quite a contentious topic in the District. This area where the pilot is, the main land use is commercial mixed use. Very limited residents live here. That was an environmental factor that allowed this pilot to develop and thrive. In parallel, the predominant curb use in the study area is metered parking from 7AM-10PM Monday-Saturday (excluding rush hours), then unregulated parking for all other times. We confirmed this via a curbside audit looking at spatial and temporal use of the curb.
- Merchants/folks weren't upset with loss of auto parking? What was the parking supply near the nightlife area like?
 - There was some opposition, but was overcome by fellow merchants who were champions in the development of the pilot, who have noticed the trend that their clientele are arriving to the area via alternative transportation options. To best improve the customer experience, they had previously operated a valet staging zone, which got out of hand (different operating standards and operators as well as safety concerns due to double parking for valet staging) and the Metropolitan Police Department pulled the permits a few years ago. This pilot creates a common platform for customers to easily access the curb for pick-up/drop off, which then aligns with merchant goals of improving the customer experience.

Questions to San Francisco:

- How did SF get your idle time projections/data?
 - We conducted fieldwork at the curb, where staff and interns were asked to clock the dwell time for PU/DO. We were able to verify these numbers with a consultant and other departments working on TNC issues.
- What was the source of the before and after slide of cab pickups used in the SFMTA slide.
 - Those graphics were provided by Lyft as part of a pilot effort they embarked on with Livable City, Curbing the Caltrain Cluster. They monitored Lyft drivers PU/DO adjacent to a regional rail station, 4th and King Station. Here are a few links from [Livable City](#) and [Hoodline](#).
- How did the SFMTA obtain their mode split data?
 - Since 2012, SFMTA has conducted an annual Travel Decision Survey. Details [here](#).
- Has Uber/Lyft requested any curb space/passenger pick up zones through the Color Curb Program?
 - Not at this time. Only fronting property and business owners are allowed to apply to the Color Curb Program for curb color change requests.

Questions to Everyone:

ADA Compliance

- How are ADA concerns being incorporated into curb lane management? How are you incorporating accessibility / ADA access to these flex loading zones per Federal/state requirements?
 - For the District, please refer to our [FAQ on Metered ADA parking](#). The spaces are reserved 24/7, but payment enforcement hours match adjacent meters on the block. Outside of that, there are ADA compliant curb ramps on these curbsides, which facilitates curb access from these pick-up lanes.

Conflicts

- Can you both please discuss if you had any conflicts or issues with including new or existing Valet Zones into your programs?
 - Earlier iteration to facilitate curb access was a valet program. MPD pulled those permits years ago, which prompted the businesses, Golden Triangle BID, DDOT, and other stakeholders to think outside the box, yielding our current pilot.
- DC/SFMTA: Convenience typically wins. If you make TNC use more convenient, are you concerned that you will be further inducing TNC usage, as opposed to figuring out alternative ways to compete for the convenience of travelers that is sustainable and equitable, as opposed to TNC usage?
 - DC - That is a concern, but it is incumbent to make all modes of transportation more convenient. For the District, that means equitable, safe access to the curbside for all modes. From there it is up to the mode to leverage that equitable, safe access.

Geofencing and Analysis

- How is geofencing established? Are these zones set by the city, then translate into UI for the user, i.e. "you can only be picked up in this nearby area"?
 - The District rarely uses geofencing. We only use them for special events and ensure that we keep it constrained. Our foray into geofencing started for the 2017 Presidential Inauguration and continued for the beginning of the 2017 Nationals baseball season. We quickly discovered that the geofencing was repeatedly ignored by drivers. We went back to the table with the TNC operators and reframed the conversation less on the District dictating where they can/t operate to the higher goal of what passenger behavior modification we want to see. For the baseball stadium area, we noted we want to limit congestion due to pickups on our two major arteries by the stadium. The TNC operators then modified dispersal of pickups.

- Is there currently a tool for cities to draw and map the curb with all the details like colored zones, times, permissions, street sweeping, construction, that can be stored and micro-licensed out to curb access? Is there a software tool you are using to help solve these problems?
 - The micro-licensing is an interesting concept and would like to learn more what you mean. But for mapping the curb, we are using an ESRI platform and custom building tools here at DDOT to drill down to spatio-temporal curb use, so we can identify and prevent curb use conflicts.
 - In San Francisco this effort is largely a manual process utilizing existing digital data sets, but requiring in field verification. We are interested in exploring less labor intensive options for collecting and maintaining this data.

Freight and Deliveries

- Is there any coordination with freight/delivery companies when the discussions about how long or where a company can be loading/unloading?
 - The District does coordinate with freight/delivery companies regarding where to load/unload. Within the context of this pilot it was not needed here but if there was a conflict in that loading needed/wanted to use the curbside we would speak with the businesses to talk about how/when/what size vehicle and discuss where the trucks can load/unload. After implementation it becomes an enforcement issue. In general the District uses the same type of idea if there is a conflict with a project or program. We also discuss loading during permitting, manage a commercial vehicle loading zone program that looks in-depth at where loading zones are and who is using them and how to better place them in the future.
- Can anyone speak about e-commerce deliveries and managing them?
 - The District is looking at package deliveries and the future of package deliveries and how they can/will/should be accommodated. We partner with package deliver carriers, coordinate with the Office of Planning to determine if zoning codes need changed, look at loading zones and where they exist or might need to exist in residential areas, are investigating lockers in public-space and other potential options for managing package delivery.

Moving Beyond the Pilots

- How much further would each city take these concepts - city wide or limited to high volume traffic areas or just a few streets?
 - We are going to be evaluating and answering those questions in the District in 2018 via a working group.
- Is there demand to widen sidewalks? Another potential use of the curb!
 - In parts of the District, the Business Improvement District is already doing that. Such example is the Georgetown BID, which does it several times a year to facilitate shopping and influx of visitors to Georgetown University.