San Francisco Transportation Sustainability Program

Complete Streets
San Diego Conference

Tilly Chang
San Francisco Transportation Authority
June 22, 2012
The Problems with Level of Service Metric

SF’s use of LOS in CEQA transportation analysis is problematic for many reasons:

- LOS does not capture important environmental effects (reflects motorist delay)
- LOS contradicts the City’s Transit First policies
- LOS is costly and time consuming for project sponsors, creates uncertainty
- LOS impact mitigation is not fair (last in problem)
- LOS impact mitigations often not feasible, not effective
- LOS metric is burdensome for Planning Dept. to implement
LOS does not reflect City Policies

Providing a pedestrian crossing here would increase delays for right-turning drivers, potentially triggering significant LOS impacts...

Minimizing automobile delays takes precedence over pedestrian access and safety.
TSP History

2003
- Authority Board adopts Strategic Analysis Report 02-03, which recommends alternatives to LOS for CEQA analysis

2008
- Authority Board recommends replacing LOS with a trip generation-based impact measure and mitigation fee

2009
- Nexus study on fee program begins
- Joint effort of Authority, Planning, SFMTA, and MOED
- State Resources Agency revises CEQA guidelines; change supports SF’s approach

2012
- Nexus Study and enabling ordinance drafted
- Stakeholder outreach conducted
Automobile Trip Impacts on User, System, & Environment
Alternatives considered to replace LOS

**Customer-Based**
- Multimodal LOS
- Categorical Exemption

**System-Efficiency Based**
- Area-wide or corridor LOS
- Person-throughput
- Master /Programmatic EIRs
- Automobile Trips Generated

**Other Steps**
- Reversible Pilots
- Adopt priority modal networks for transit, bicycling, walking
- Adopt Infill Opportunity Zone
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What it Is</th>
<th>What it Does</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• New transportation impact analysis methodology under CEQA (discontinues Level of Service, or LOS)</td>
<td>• Harmonizes California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) implementation with City’s Transit First policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Citywide development impact fee to replace Transit Impact Development Fee (TIDF) &amp; plan area fees</td>
<td>• Streamlines CEQA review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Mitigates transportation impacts more fairly and effectively</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CEQA Methodology Change

- Replaces LOS as CEQA metric with transit system performance (delay, crowding) measures

- Land use projects’ impacts commensurate with transportation impacts of net new development
  - Site-specific analysis would continue to be performed (loading docs, curb cuts)

- Most transportation projects would not have to undergo transportation analysis
  - Transit impact analysis would be required in a limited number of cases (road diets, ROW shifts) on transit streets
Mitigation Fee Program

- Combines separate fees (TIDF, plan area fees) into one fee program
- Invests in improvements to offset cumulative impacts of growth on the city’s transportation system
- Leverages fee revenues strategically
  - Raises ~$630M over 20 years
  - Leverages an additional $820M in Prop K and other funds

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fee Category</th>
<th>Share</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Transit Service Expansions</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Transit Reliability Improvements</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Regional Transit</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Bike, Ped, Pricing, and TDM</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administration</td>
<td>&lt;1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY
## Proposed Transportation Sustainability Fee Rates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Activity Category</th>
<th>TSF Per Sq. Ft.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Residential</td>
<td>$5.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nonresidential</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management, Information and Professional Services</td>
<td>$12.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail / Entertainment</td>
<td>$13.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production, Distribution, Repair</td>
<td>$6.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural / Institution / Education</td>
<td>$13.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical and Health Services</td>
<td>$13.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visitor Services</td>
<td>$12.64</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Potential Discounts being considered for:

- Small, affordable housing projects
- Land use projects providing less than allowable parking
- Small businesses using existing vacant space

Maximum $40M available for discounts over 20 years of program.
Next Steps

**2012**
- Determine fee discounts
- Continue outreach
- Introduce ordinance
- Begin environmental review

**2013**
- Complete environmental review
- Adopt legislation
Transportation Sustainability Program

Thank you.

Questions?