

*Appendix A*

*Experience of Other Communities with Pedestrian Malls*

## Appendix A

### Experience of Other Communities with Pedestrian Malls

| City   | State | Name              | Population<br>* | Yr. Built | Transit | Length     | Reopened  | Reference                        | Design                                    | Comments   |
|--|-------|-------------------|-----------------|-----------|---------|------------|-----------|----------------------------------|---|--|
| <b>PEDESTRIAN MALLS THAT HAVE REOPENED (AT LEAST PARTIALLY) TO VEHICULAR TRAFFIC</b> |       |                   |                 |           |         |            |           |                                  |   |  |
| Allentown  | PA    | Hamilton Mall     | 106,000         | 1973      | no      | 4 blocks   | yes       | HR                               |   | HR case study  |
| Ashtabula  | OH    |                   |                 | 1979      |         | 4 blocks   | 1983      |                                  |   |  |
| Baltimore  | MD    | Oldtown Mall      | 657,000         | 1976      | no      | 3 blocks   | 2000      | HP/HR/NYT/<br>AV/SCT             |   | HR case study/HP case study  |
| Battle Creek   | MI    | Michigan Mall     | 53,000          | 1975      | no      | 4 blocks   | 1992      | EMU/HR                           |   | HR case study  |
| Burbank  | CA    | Golden Mall       | 100,000         |           |         |            | 1989      | AV/SCT                           |   |  |
| Burlington   | IO    | Jefferson St.     | 27,000          | 1970's    | no      | 2 blocks   | 1990      | MS/SCT                           | opened 1 block                            |  |
| Champaign  | IL    |                   | 67,000          |           |         |            | yes       | SCT                              |   |  |
| Chicago  | IL    | State St.         | 2,900,000       | 1979      | buses   | 9 blocks   | 1996      | ULI/APA/AV/<br>PI                |   | thriving again - AV; has brought vitality "positively transformed the pedestrian experience"   |
| Danville   | IL    |                   | 34,000          |           |         |            |           | SCT                              |   |  |
| Decatur  | IL    |                   | 82,000          |           |         |            | yes       | SCT                              |   |  |
| Elgin  | IL    |                   | 94,000          |           |         |            | yes       | SCT                              |   |  |
| Eugene   | OR    | City Center Mall  | 138,000         | 1971      | no      | 7.5 blocks | 1985      | HP/HR/SCT/N<br>YT/APA/SM/<br>DRA | opened 2 blocks and approved opening rest | Opening resulted in reinvestment & opening of new businesses. Vacancy rate went from 25 to 6 percent in 4 years. - HP, creating a pedestrian oriented street, but with auto access - MS. |
| Fargo  | ND    |                   | 91,000          |           |         |            | yes       | SCT                              |   |  |
| Fayetteville   | NC    | Franklin Commons  | ?               |           | no      | 3 blocks   | yes       | SCT/PV                           |   |  |
| Freeport   | NY    |                   | 44,000          | 1977      |         |            | 1987      | AV/SCT                           |   |  |
| Galveston  | TX    | Post Office St.   | 57,000          |           |         |            | yes       | TLCNET/MS/S<br>CT                |   |  |
| Greenville   | NC    |                   | 60,000          |           |         |            | yes       | HA/HR                            |   |  |
| Greenville   | SC    |                   |                 | 1977      | no      | 5 blocks   | yes       | DRA                              | 2-way traffic w/ angled parking           | very successful after reopening for traffic  |
| Helena   | MT    |                   | 26,000          |           |         |            | yes       | SCT                              |   |  |
| Kalamazoo  | MI    | S. Burdick St.    | 77,000          | 1959      |         | 4 blocks   | 1998      | city web/ NYT/SCT/APA/AV         |   |  |
| Lansing  | MI    | N. Washington St. | 119,000         | 1971      | no      | 3 blocks   | 2001      | newspaper/HR                     |   | HR case study  |
| Little Rock  | AR    | Main Street       | 183,000         | 1977      | no      | 6 blocks   | 1991      | MS/NYT                           | opened 5 of 6 blocks                      | businesses have returned but still high vacancy - MS   |
| Louisville   | KY    | 4th St.           | 256,000         | 1973      | trolley | 8 blocks   | 1989/2000 | Louisville web/HR/SCT/<br>PI     | opened 5 blocks                           | Vacancy rate decreased from 80% to 50%. Increase in property values.   |

| City         | State | Name                  | Population *   | Yr. Built | Transit | Length     | Reopened       | Reference                 | Design                                    | Comments   |
|--------------|-------|-----------------------|----------------|-----------|---------|------------|----------------|---------------------------|---|--|
| Milwaukee    | WI    |                       | 597,000        |           |         |            | yes            | NYT                       |   |  |
| Muncie       | IN    |                       | 67,000         |           |         |            | yes            | HR/SCT                    |   |  |
| New London   | CT    | Captain's Walk        | 26,000         | 1973      | no      | 6 blocks   | yes            | HR/MS/SCT                 |   | HR case study - very positive results from reopening - MS  |
| Norfolk      | VA    | Granby St. Mall       | <b>234,000</b> | 1976      | no      | 6 blocks   | 1988           | MS/PI                     | 2-way street                              | mixed success with traffic - APA/PI. Additional resaurants and office activities, but little new retail - PI                                     |
| Oak Park     | IL    | Lake St.              | 53,000         | 1972      | no      | 4 blocks   | 1988           | EMU/HP/SM/SCT/NYT/APA/PPS | opened 3 of 4 blocks                      | sales up 15 to 20%, spurred significant private reinvestment - HP. Vacancy rate went from 25 to 19% and is now only 5%                           |
| Ottawa       |       | Sparks St. Mall       | <b>365,000</b> | 1967      | no      | 5 blocks   | 1999           | TLC Net/PI                | one-way                                   | pedestrian only between 10-6   |
| Pittsburgh   | PA    | East Liberty          | <b>334,000</b> | 1969      | buses   | 2 blocks   | 1986           | MS/NYT/PI                 | 2-way traffic                             | sales went up immediately - MS - but success was brief - PI  |
| Portland     | OR    | Portland Transit Mall | 529,000        | 1977      | buses   | 22 blocks  | allows traffic | HR/SCT                    | allows traffic on 1 lane for most of mall | HR case study  |
| Pougkkeepsie | NY    |                       | 30,000         | 1970's    |         | 4 blocks   | 2001           | Gov. office/NYT/PI        | 2 travel lanes with parking               | Opening has stimulated much interest in reuse, especially retail with residential above.   |
| Providence   | RI    | Kennedy Plaza         | 174,000        |           | buses   |            | 1990's         | TLC Net                   |   |  |
| Rock Hill    | SC    |                       |                |           |         |            | recently       | SM                        |   |  |
| Rockford     | IL    |                       | 150,000        |           |         |            | yes            | SCT                       |   |  |
| Sacramento   | CA    |                       | 407,000        |           | LRRT    |            | yes            | NYT/AV                    |   | 1 end reopened 1998  |
| Salisbury    | MD    |                       | 24,000         |           |         |            | 2001           | city                      |   |  |
| Santa Monica | CA    | 3rd St. Promenade     | 84,000         | 1965      |         | 3 blocks   | 1989/1992      | HP/MS/NYT/ULI             | closed to cars 10-4                       | number of businesses increased by 30%, property values doubled - HP  |
| Scranton     | PA    | Wyoming Ave. Plaza    | 76,000         | 1978      | no      | 1 block    | yes            | HR                        |   | HR case study  |
| Sheboygan    | WI    | Harbor Center         | 51,000         | 1976      | no      | 3.5 blocks | yes            | HR                        |   | HR case study  |
| Sioux Falls  | SD    |                       | 124,000        | 1970's    |         | 2 blocks   | 1987           | HP/SM                     | opened 1 block                            | sales and property values have increased - HP. Wanted to reopen remaining block  |
| South Bend   | IN    | Michigan St.          | 108,000        | 1970's    |         |            | 1987           | MS                        |   | retail sales increased 20% & vacancies decreased - MS  |
| Springfield  | MO    |                       | 152,000        |           |         |            | yes            | SCT                       |   |  |
| St. Joseph   | MO    | Main Street           | 74,000         | 1974      | no      | 5 blocks   | 1991           | MS/HP                     | on-street parking                         | MS case study/HP case study  |
| Tacoma       | WA    | Broadway Plaza        | <b>194,000</b> | 1976      | no      | 2 blocks   | 1980's         | HR/SCT/PI                 |   | HR case study, adding traffic an initial success, but anchor department stores left . Restaurants have increased but retail has increased little |
| Tampa        | FL    | Franklin St.          | <b>303,000</b> | 1970's    | no      | 9 blocks   | November 2001  | APA/AV/PI/D RA            | open 2 blocks                             | Too early to gauge results - PI  |
| Toronto      |       | Yonge Street          |                |           | trolley |            | yes            | AV                        |   | going great - AV   |
| Trenton      | NJ    | Market Street Mall    | 85,000         | 1974      |         | 2 blocks   | yes            | MS                        | open 1 block                              | business has improved since opening - MS   |

| City                               | State | Name                  | Population* | Yr. Built | Transit        | Length    | Reopened          | Reference            | Design   | Comments  |
|------------------------------------|-------|-----------------------|-------------|-----------|----------------|-----------|-------------------|----------------------|--|---|
| Tulsa                              | OK    | Main St. Mall         | 393,000     | 1970's    |                | 3 blocks  | recently          | DRA                  | design allows closure of street for special events |   |
| Vancouver                          | BC    | Granville Mall        | 426,000     | 1974      | buses          | 6 blocks  | 1988              | city web/HR          | opened 1 block in 1988                             | studying opening rest of pedestrian mall  |
| Vicksburg                          | MS    | Main Street           | 26,000      | 1970's    |                | 2 blocks  | 1980's            | HP/SM                | one-way traffic                                    | sales increased and property values increased significantly - HP/SM               |
| Waco                               | TX    | Austin Ave.           | 114,000     |           |                |           | 1986              | TLCNET/MS/SCT        |  | ground floor vacancies dropped from 80 to 40% after opening - MS                  |
| West Chester                       | PA    | Gay Street Mall       | 18,000      |           |                |           | yes               | HR                   |  |   |
| Wilmington                         | DE    | Market St. Mall       | 73,000      |           |                | 4 blocks  | 1990's            | MS/NYT/HR            | opened 2 blocks                                    | mixed success with restoring traffic - MS   |
| Winston-Salem                      | NC    |                       | 186,000     | 1971      |                |           | 1981              | MS                   |  |   |
| Youngstown                         | OH    | Federal St.           | 82,000      | 1980      |                |           | 2001              | newspaper            |  |   |
| <b>SUCCESSFUL PEDESTRIAN MALLS</b> |       |                       |             |           |                |           |                   |                      |  |   |
| Aspen                              | CO    |                       | 6,000       |           |                |           | closed to traffic |                      |  | decided not to expand pedestrian mall   |
| Boulder                            | CO    | Pearl St.             | 95,000      | 1977      |                | 4 blocks  | closed to traffic | TLCNET/NYT/SCT/ DRA  |  | very successful - relies on govt. offices & universities                          |
| Burlington                         | VT    | Church St.            | 39,000      | 1981      |                | 4 blocks  | closed to traffic | TLCNET/NYT/MS        |  |   |
| Cape May                           | NJ    |                       | 4,000       |           |                | 4 blocks  | closed to traffic | NYT/MS               |  | successful because of tourists - MS   |
| Charlottesville                    | VA    |                       | 45,000      | 1976      | no             | 8 blocks  | closed to traffic | TLCNET/HR/MS/SCT     |  | moderately successful, UVA within 1 mile  |
| Denver                             | CO    | 16th St. Mall         | 554,000     | 1982      | electric buses | 13 blocks | closed to traffic | HR/MS/SCT/PI         |  | highest rents at mall/116,000 office workers within 2 blocks & tourists           |
| Ithaca                             | NY    | Ithaca Commons        | 29,000      | 1975      | no             | 3 blocks  | closed to traffic | TLCNET/MS/HP/SCT/DM  |  | HP case study, 95% occupancy  |
| Madison                            | WI    | State Street          | 208,000     | 1970's    | buses          | 6 blocks  | closed to traffic | AV/PI                |  |   |
| Minneapolis                        | MN    | Nicollet Mall         | 383,000     | 1967      | buses          | 14 blocks | closed to traffic | TLCNET/HR/PA/ SCT/PI | 2-way  | 160,000 workers within 2 blocks; 30,000 residents within walking distance of mall |
| <b>STRUGGLING PEDESTRIAN MALLS</b> |       |                       |             |           |                |           |                   |                      |  |   |
| Buffalo                            | NY    | Main Street           | 293,000     | 1986      | LRRT           | 10 blocks | proposed          |                      |  | allowing cars is being discussed  |
| Evansville                         | IN    |                       | 122,000     | 1971      | trolley        | 7 blocks  | proposed          | SCT/DRA              |  | Occupancy very low, few thriving businesses                                       |
| Fresno                             | CA    | Fulton Mall           | 428,000     | 1964      | no             | 6 blocks  | proposed          | HR/ APA/ FB          |  | HR case study, Plan proposed to reopen mall to 2-way traffic                      |
| Honolulu                           | HI    | Fort St. Mall         | 372,000     | 1969      | no             | 6 blocks  | no                | HA/HR/PI             |  | HR case study, Hawaii Pacific University Campus nearby                            |
| Miami Beach                        | FL    | Lincoln Road          | 362,000     | 1959      | trams          |           | no                | HP/ APA/ PI          | 2-way  |   |
| Raleigh                            | NC    | Fayetteville St. Mall | 376,000     | 1976      | no             | 4 blocks  | proposed          | NYT/ APA/ PV/ PI     |  | has had limited success, "not commercially viable" - PI                           |
| St. Louis                          | MO    | North 14th St. Mall   | 348,000     | 1980's    | no             | 2 blocks  | proposed          | St. Louis web/PI     |  | "Project totally backfired - all retail stores are gone" - PI                     |

\* U.S. Census of Population, 2000. Population figures in bold are plus or minus 100,000 people of Buffalo's population.

## Sources

- EMU Eastern Michigan University, Downtown Pedestrian Malls, <http://www.emich.edu/public/geo/557book/d210.pedmall.html>
- MS National Main Street Program - An Information Brief on Downtown Pedestrian Malls, April 1998.
- HP Hyatt Palma, Inc., Survey of Other Cities with Pedestrian Mills for City of Poughkeepsie, December 1989.
- SCT Shopping Centers Today, Cities Walking Away From Pedestrian Malls, December 1987.
- APA American Planning Association, Planning Magazine, From Street to Mall and Back, by Larry Houstoun, June 1990.
- NYT New York Times, When Shoppers Walk Away from Pedestrian Malls, November 5, 1996.
- Gov. Office Press release from Governor Pataki's office, September 15, 2000.
- ULI Urban Land Institute, State Street Reviving the Heartbeat of the Loop, February 1996; and from Locklaister Pedestrian Mall to Lively Streetscape, November 1992.
- HA Honolulu Advertiser, Kalakaua Pedestrian mall as a bad idea, June 2, 1999.
- PPS Project for Public Spaces, Oak Park, IL, <http://www.pps.org>
- HR Harvey Rubenstein, Pedestrian Malls, Streetscapes, and Urban Spaces, published by John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 1992.
- AV ArtVoice, Bringing Traffic Back To Main Street, by Geoff Kelly, December 13, 2001
- PV Personal Visit by ERM
- PI Phone interview by ERM
- DRA Downtown Raleigh Alliance survey
- SM Salisbury, MD survey
- FB Fresno Bee, April 11, 2002
- DM Downtown Montreal Commercial Development Association, March 2000